

## **IMPROVING VOCABULARY MATERY USING INTRALINGUAL SUBTITLE AND VOCABULARY SELF- COLLECTION STRATEGY**

**Dias Tiara Putri Utomo**

*Universitas Muhammadiyah Lamongan, Indonesia*

diastiara@umla.ac.id

**Abstract:** As one of the language components, vocabulary is an essential factor to master language skills. However, learning vocabulary is assumed to be a boring activity that the students are not interested in. This research aims at improving students' vocabulary mastery using intralingual subtitle and vocabulary self-collection strategy. A classroom action research was carried out to solve the seventh (7<sup>th</sup>) graders' problems regarding vocabulary mastery. The subjects of the study were 35 students of seventh grade at one of the junior high schools in Malang. The instruments used in this study were an interview guide for the English teacher, observation notes, questionnaire, and vocabulary tests. The researcher set the criteria of success 75% of the students achieved a score equal or higher than 75 in the vocabulary test and 75% of the students showed positive responses toward the implementation of the strategy. The result of the study showed that (1) 83% of the students or 29 out of 35 students achieved score equal or higher than 75, indicating that the use of intralingual subtitle and vocabulary self-collection strategy improved students' vocabulary mastery, (2) there were 5 (five) major steps in implementing intralingual subtitle and vocabulary self-collection strategy to improve students' vocabulary mastery, (3) 90% of the students showed the positive responses to the implementation of the strategy.

**Keywords:** *teaching vocabulary, intralingual subtitle, vocabulary self-collection strategy, junior high school*

### **INTRODUCTION**

In general, learning English is focused on four prominent skills within two main categories: listening and reading (receptive skills) and writing and speaking (productive skills). To achieve an outstanding capability of the skills, students are expected to master language components, one of which is vocabulary. To aver the importance of vocabulary in reading, Colombo (2012) mentions that limited vocabulary will make students work harder in comprehending reading texts and read less as well. Limited vocabulary also affects students in doing the task. Students can be very frustrated when they just do not have words they need particularly in a productive task (Harmer, 2001). In other words, students will not be able to have a capable speaking or writing skill if they do not own words to express their ideas.

Learning vocabulary is assumed to be a boring activity that the students are not interested in. In many cases, junior high school English teachers instructed their students to do students' worksheet or called as *lembar kerja siswa* containing

cloze tests and picture-cued tests. This activity did not attract students' interest since it involved less meaningful teaching and learning process.

Based on the results of questionnaires in the preliminary study, it was obtained that 94% of the students or 33 out of 35 students were keen to learn English; however, the obstacle was on vocabulary mastery. Then, the results of students' vocabulary mastery indicated that 23 out of 35 students or 66% of the students achieved score under the passing grade of English lesson, namely 75 and the average score of the test was 73.31. This problem required to be solved since the 7<sup>th</sup> graders had to be well-prepared before facing the next grade.

Furthermore, interviews with the English teacher disclosed that generally, the students were interested in the use of media in learning English. From a teacher's perspective, the media can be employed to teach materials and accelerate students to reach the goal. One of which is video. According to Bull & Bell (2010) video is a teaching aid in which the teachers may have the opportunity to engage students' interest, facilitate students in facing troublesome materials, or enhance long-term retention of knowledge. In this research, an animation video is exclusively utilized to be the medium for improving students' vocabulary due to its benefits. The use of animation video can increase students' motivation, enthusiasm, focus, and make the materials become easier (Khalidiyah, 2015).

However, it will be strenuous for the students to acquire vocabulary if they just rely on listening comprehension from the video. To facilitate students' overall comprehension, the use of intralingual subtitle plays a significant role. In terms of its purpose for second language learning, Caimi (2006) exposed that intralingual subtitle changes intersemiotic reception, through pictures and sound, into multi-semiotic reception. For foreign language learners, this includes hearing, reading, and also the depiction of pictures.

Intralingual subtitle is frequently referred to as captions because it deals with the same language for either the sound or the written text. In Caimi's (2006) paper, intralingual subtitle is also labeled as monolingual subtitle which defined as the transference of oral language to written language in the form of screen translation. The subtitle is usually placed at the center, bottom of the screen. Further, she highlights two types of intralingual subtitle based on its purpose: used as accessibility aid and used as didactic aid. Intralingual subtitle which served as accessibility aid is addressed to those who are deaf or have hearing-impaired while as the didactic aid, intralingual subtitle is used to assist those who are not familiar with the target language. Intralingual subtitle juxtaposes phonological expression and the written form so that the foreign language learners master overall language comprehension.

In his paper entitled *On the Classification of Subtitling*, Liu (2014) clarifies the language learners group as one of the targets for intralingual subtitle use. The group includes foreign learners who aim to improve their ability in the target language. Moreover, the learners usually belong to minorities including refugees, immigrants, or learners with literacy problems.

The use of intralingual subtitle as didactic aid in language learning especially L2 development has attracted researchers and educators worldwide. In 2018, research by Matiolo, Oliveira, & Baretta (2018) disclosed a fact that there were at least 18 empirical studies regarding intralingual and interlingual subtitle in L2 learning between 1991 and 2013. Most of the studies indicated that the use

of intralingual subtitle was more favorable for L2 development than the interlingual one.

In addition to the use of intralingual subtitle for improving students' vocabulary mastery, vocabulary self-collection strategy or VSS is deployed. Vocabulary self-collection strategy (VSS), initially introduced by Haggard (now Ruddell) in 1982 and 1986, offers conscious vocabulary learning and has adjoined in teaching vocabulary for diverse grades and students. The strategy focuses on students' choice toward important words to study and involves them in meaningful experience during selecting the words. Vocabulary self-collection strategy can be an efficacious medium in facilitating students to be independent learners and broaden the range of their vocabulary knowledge.

According to Martin, Martin, & Ying (2002) vocabulary self-collection strategy presents three prominent proportions. First, students acquire new vocabulary through own experience and world knowledge. Second, through VSS students are motivated to learn new words. Eventually, the strategy makes students more enthusiastic in learning and selecting new vocabulary.

Ruddell & Shearer (2002) describe that to apply this strategy students may select their important words from any source either inside or outside the school or may be based on their prior knowledge such as, from academic reading, novels, television or even music. In this research, the source was determined by the teacher, that was from the animation video played at the beginning of the class. Furthermore, the VSS is supported by a graph to facilitate students in implementing the strategy, in particular when the students choose the important words after watching the video and during the discussion with their partners.

The original steps in carrying out vocabulary self-collection strategy in small groups as suggested by Antonacci, O'Callaghan, & Berkowitz (2015) are as follows: 1) introducing VSS to the students, 2) grouping the students into small group for reading and discussing the word they wish to nominate, 3) doing VSS graph, and finally 4) presenting the words to the class. To suit the use of intralingual subtitle, the steps are modified, especially by changing the step of reading to watching animation video with intralingual subtitle.

Considering the benefits of intralingual subtitle and vocabulary self-collection strategy, the researcher formulated the problem as follows: How can intralingual subtitle and vocabulary self-collection strategy be used to improve the 7<sup>th</sup> graders' vocabulary mastery?

## **METHOD**

### **Research Design**

This research was a classroom action research that used the model of Kemmis and McTaggart (1998) as cited in Latief (2014), involving four main phases (planning, acting, observing, and reflecting) in a cycle. Classroom action research was chosen since the research was performed to solve vocabulary mastery problems faced by the 7<sup>th</sup> graders. The researcher conducted the study collaboratively with an English teacher in terms of identifying problems, designing tests, making lesson plans, setting criteria of success, making research schedule, managing classroom, and collecting and analyzing data.

### **Setting and Subjects of the Research**

The subjects of the research were 35 students of the 7<sup>th</sup> grade in a junior high school in Malang. According to the results of the preliminary study, the subjects had vocabulary mastery problems, thus the action research was conducted in that class.

## **The Cycle**

### ***Planning***

This research was carried out in one cycle consisting of two meetings. In planning the action, the researcher prepared lesson plan, materials, media, instruments, and research schedule. The materials were obtained from basic competence 3.5 and 4.6 in the 7<sup>th</sup> grade syllabus of curriculum 2013 which states “. . . menyatakan dan menanyakan nama dan jumlah benda yang dekat dengan kehidupan siswa sehari-hari” (to state and ask the name and the total number of things in student's daily life). Related to the materials, two animation videos with intralingual subtitle were selected, in which they were provided by a youtube channel entitled “EFL Kids Videos”. The researcher also designed a vocabulary self-collection strategy graph for group works. The graph consisted of one circle and four boxes.

### ***Action***

In the acting phase, the researcher acted as a teacher who taught the students, meanwhile, the English teacher and researcher colleague acted as observers. They were assigned to write any situation happened in the classroom during the implementation of the strategy in observation notes.

In the first meeting, the material was about naming and counting things in the school. First, the teacher gave several examples of how to say singular and plural forms of things in the school. Then, the teacher asked the students to make their sentences related to the material. If they had understood what they were going to learn, the researcher played the two videos about school vocabulary. Before watching them, the students were instructed to choose one word from the video and wrote it down in their books.

Then, the students were asked to work in their groups. One group consisted of three up to four members. Each group was given two pieces of VSS graphs in which they had to select or eliminate the words they chose into only two words. To fill the VSS graph, the students had to watch the video once more. After that, they could continue to complete the graph through group discussion in 20 minutes. Then, each group had to present their works in front of the class. Eventually, students and teacher analyzed the word list which had been previously written on the board. Before the lesson ended, the researcher collected the students' VSS graphs. The teaching and learning process in the second meeting was almost similar to the first meeting, but the material was different. It was about naming and counting things in the house.

### ***Observing***

After the implementation of the strategy competed, the researcher observed the interview guide, questionnaire, observation notes, and vocabulary test to collect the data related to the criteria of success.

### **Reflecting**

Then, the results of the analysis were evaluated by comparing them with the criteria of success. The implementation of the strategy is successful if 75% of the students or 26 students out of 35 students achieve a score equal or higher than 75 in vocabulary test and if 75% of the students show the positive responses toward indicated by students' questionnaire.

## **RESULTS AND DISCUSSION**

The findings present three main points: the improvement of students' vocabulary mastery, implementation of the strategy, and students' responses to the implementation of the strategy.

### **The Improvement of Students' Vocabulary Mastery**

This study aimed to improve students' vocabulary mastery using intralingual subtitle and vocabulary self-collection strategy. The use of intralingual subtitle and VSS had succeeded to improve the students' vocabulary mastery in one cycle. The researcher measured the improvement of students' vocabulary mastery by giving them vocabulary test in the third meeting. The vocabulary test contained 40 questions about naming and counting things. It was obtained that 83% of students or 29 out of 35 the students achieved a score equal or higher than 75. The students' average score also increased from 73.31 (in the preliminary study) to 87.14 (in the end of the cycle).

The findings are in line with Meiningsih's study (2015) which found that vocabulary self-collection strategy had not only succeeded in helping the students to enrich their vocabulary but also remembering words easily.

Moreover, based on the VSS graphs both in meeting 1 and 2, only 3 out of 32 graphs were checked for "unfamiliar words". This meant that the students were familiar with the words. They might know the words either in their elementary school or in their environments. However, they had problems remembering the words and how the words were used in sentences. That was why the students did not need much effort to acknowledge the 18 words for each meeting during the implementation of the strategy. When the students were given the vocabulary test on the following week, the students did the test well.

Harmer (2012) mentions four possible ways of helping students to remember new words in which two of those are suitable for this study. They are arousal and affect (A&A) and cognitive engagement (CE). A&A deals with the affective meaning which students have with the words (that is if their feeling is engaged). CE is more likely to remember words when students do some work with them. When students did the VSS graph, they could choose the words based on the intra-lingual subtitle in animation video, and then made their sentences. Finally, they also found the reason for choosing the word. That is why the students could remember the word easier since they were involved directly in the words by doing various activities in class.

### **Implementation of the Strategy**

VSS is suitable for active and enthusiastic students in learning words. Haggard (1986) mentions the two adaptations of VSS which are designed for small group instruction. They are 1) open vocabulary self-collection and 2)

limited vocabulary self-collection. In general, this research adapted open vocabulary self-collection since the students in the group had to find the word on their own so they can learn more.

Related to the use of VSS in a small group, Antonacci et al., (2015) suggest the implementation of VSS as the following steps.

1. Introducing the VSS.  
The teacher introduces the purpose of VSS as well as familiarizes the students with the strategy.
2. Grouping the students.  
The students work into a small group for reading and discussing the word they wish to nominate.
3. Doing the VSS graph, and  
The students write the two words on the VSS graph.
4. Presenting its two words.  
Each group presents its two words to the class and writes the words on the board to make the word list.

In Indonesia, where English is established as a foreign language, VSS has been adapted and modified for various studies. For instance, the study conducted by Nengsih (2013) combined VSS and word wall strategy to improve vocabulary in the descriptive text for young learners. Another study related to combining VSS with other strategies was carried out by Mandasari (2013). She used VSS and a possible sentence strategy to enrich students' vocabulary. Both Nengsih's (2013) and Mandasari's (2013) studies proved that VSS was applicable to be combined with other strategies.

Thus, the researcher combined the use of intralingual subtitle in animation video and VSS to improve students' vocabulary mastery. The steps were adapted from Antonacci et al., (2015) steps with some modifications needed. The steps were formulated as follows:

1. Watching the animation video with intralingual subtitle.
2. Grouping the students.
3. Filling the VSS graph.
4. Presenting the VSS graph in front of the class, and
5. Analyzing the word list.

There are three points of modifications in this research. First, intralingual subtitle shifts the role of reading text. Intralingual subtitle in animation video facilitates the students to acknowledge words from spoken and written forms. That is why the steps were started from watching the animation video. Then, the students worked in small groups to nominate the words. The second was the form of VSS graphs. After deciding which words they wanted to share, the students filled the VSS graph. When filling the graph, the students in the group watched the video once more to fill the top box of the graph (word in the video). This aimed to make students aware of the use of the word based on the context and learn the vocabulary through repetition by using video. The third was the word list analysis. The students did not only write the words on the whiteboard but also analyze it with the teacher. In each meeting, the students had 18 words for the class word list.

In short, the use of intralingual subtitle and vocabulary self-collection strategy had been successful to improve students' vocabulary mastery with three main modifications in the steps.

### **Students' Responses to the Implementation of the Strategy**

In this study, the researcher also found that the students showed positive responses toward the use of intralingual subtitle and vocabulary self-collection strategy. The positive response is shown by the result of the questionnaire. It showed that 97% of the students or 34 out of 35 students liked the use of intralingual subtitle and vocabulary self-collection strategy. Furthermore, they assumed that the strategy was helpful and created meaningful vocabulary learning. The students also knew more vocabulary after the implementation of the strategy. There were 32 out of 35 students who thought that they learned more vocabulary; 14 out of 32 learned 1-10 words while 18 out of 32 learned 11-20 words each meeting.

Regarding the facts above, there are two possible reasons. First, the students are interested in the use of the animation video. Firdaus (2011) states that the animated pictures included in a video are attractive for the students. Meanwhile, the use of animation videos at the beginning of the class influenced the students to enjoy the rest of the class. In her study, Devi (2012) figures that animation video made the students motivated and enthusiastic during the learning process. Therefore, the students did not feel burdened and even enjoyed the implementation of the strategy. This condition is in line with the study conducted by Fatonah (2015) who reported that the students enjoyed further activities in the classroom after showed the video at the beginning of the lesson. In this case, the use of video had an important role in gaining the students' positive responses toward the implementation of the strategy.

Second, the use of intralingual subtitle and VSS had created meaningful teaching and learning. During the implementation of the strategy, the students participated in various learning activities. The various activities in the classroom made the students active during the class and prevented them to feel bored. This finding is also supported by previous research about the implementation of VSS performed by Mandasari (2013) and Meiningsih (2015). Based on her study, Mandasari (2013) concluded that using VSS during the class could motivate the students because the students enjoyed the lesson and did not feel bored in the learning process. Similar to Mandasari (2013), Meiningsih (2015) also found the same condition. She stated that the students became active participants both as individuals and groups when VSS was applied.

Moreover, the various activities give the students opportunities to explore their interests and ability. In this case, the use of intralingual subtitle facilitates the students to respect their uniqueness. This is because it involves Multiple Intelligence principle as proposed by Gardner in 1983. According to Gardner (2011) there are eight types of intelligence and the use of intralingual subtitle and VSS goes along with four of them: they are: spatial-visual intelligence, intrapersonal intelligence, linguistic intelligence, and interpersonal intelligence. Fachrurrazy (2012) states that the concept of Multiple Intelligence views not based on smart or not smart students, but in what way they are smart. In other words, MI enables the students to find out their ways to be smart. This may

explain why the students were active and enthusiastic during the implementation process. The students were able to develop their abilities based on their type of intelligence.

## **CONCLUSION**

The research resulted in the conclusions drawn as follows. First, the result of the study stated in the research findings and discussion showed that intralingual subtitle and vocabulary self-collection strategy improved students' vocabulary mastery as they reached the criteria of success. The statement is proven from the result of the vocabulary test.

Second, the steps in implementing the use of intralingual subtitle and VSS are formulated as follows. First, the students watch animation video to find interesting, important, or unfamiliar words. Second, the students work in a group of three till students to nominate the words. Third, the students fill the VSS graph through group discussion. Fourth, the students present the graphs to the whole class. Last, students together with the teacher analyze the word list which previously written on the board.

Third, the students showed positive responses toward intralingual subtitle and vocabulary self-collection strategy in vocabulary learning. The statement is supported by the results of the questionnaire distributed to the students after the implementation of the strategy.

Eventually, the researcher suggests English teachers, especially those who teach the 7<sup>th</sup> graders, to apply intra-lingual subtitle and vocabulary self-collection strategy as an alternative technique for teaching vocabulary since it has been found to improve students' vocabulary mastery. For other researchers, especially those who conduct similar research, the findings of this research can be applied as a reference in doing further research.

## **REFERENCES**

- Antonacci, P. A., O'Callaghan, C. M., & Berkowitz, E. (2015). *Developing Content Area Literacy* (2nd ed.). California: Sage Publications, Inc.
- Bull, G., & Bell, L. (2010). *Instructional Technology and Media for Learning* (1st ed.). Washington, DC.: International Society for Technology in Education.
- Caimi, A. (2006). Audiovisual Translation and Language Learning: The Promotion of Intralingual Subtitles. *The Journal of Specialised Translation*, (6), 85–98.
- Colombo, M. (2012). *Teaching English Language Learners*. California: Sage Publications, Inc. <https://doi.org/10.4018/IJTEPD.2018010105>
- Devi, I. 2012. Animation Video to Improve Students Vocabulary Mastery. *Jurnal Pendidikan Bahasa Inggris*, 1(1): 01-118, ([core.ac.uk/download/pdf/12346019.pdf](http://core.ac.uk/download/pdf/12346019.pdf)), retrieved November, 19<sup>th</sup> 2015.
- Fachrurrazy. 2012. *Teaching English as a Foreign Language for Teachers in Indonesia*. Malang: UM Press
- Fatonah, S. N. 2015. *Using Vocabulary Self-Collection Strategy to Improve Reading Comprehension of the Seventh Grade Students of SMPN 4 Kalasan in the Academic year of 2014/2015*. Published Thesis. Yogyakarta: Faculty of Languages and Arts UNY.

- Firdaus, B. G. 2011. Using Video to Enhance Students' Listening Comprehension. In Cahyono, B. Y & Kusumaningrum, S. R (Eds). *Practical Techniques for English Language Teaching* (pp. 11-14). Malang: UM Press.
- Gardner, H. (2011). *Frames of Mind: The Theory of Multiple Intelligences* (2nd ed.). New York: Basic Books.
- Haggard, M. R. (1986). The vocabulary self-collection strategy: Using student interest and world knowledge to enhance vocabulary growth. *Journal of Reading*, 29(7), 634–642.
- Harmer, J. (2001). *The Practice of English Language Teaching* (3rd ed.). Essex: Longman. <https://doi.org/10.1093/elt/57.4.401>
- Harmer, J. (2012). *Essential Teacher Knowledge: Core Concepts in English Language Teaching*. Essex: Pearson Education Limited.
- Khalidiyah, H. (2015). The Use of Animated Video in Improving Students' Reading Skill (A Quasi-Experimental Study of Seventh Grade Student at A Junior High School in Jalancagak, Subang). *Journal of English and Education*, 3(1), 59.
- Latief, M. A. 2014. *Research Methods on Language Learning An Introduction*. Malang: UM Press.
- Liu, D. (2014). On the Classification of Subtitling. *Journal of Language Teaching and Research*, 5(5), 1103–1109. <https://doi.org/10.4304/jltr.5.5.1103-1109>
- Mandasari, Y. 2013. Enriching Students' vocabulary by combining vocabulary self-collection strategy and possible sentence strategy in teaching reading at junior high school. *Jurnal Pendidikan Bahasa Inggris*, 2(2). (<http://id.portalgaruda.org/?ref=browse&mod=viewarticle&article=182807>), retrieved on November 24<sup>th</sup>, 2015.
- Martin, M. A., Martin, S. H., & Ying, W. (2002). The Vocabulary Self-Collection Strategy in the ESL Classroom. *TESOL Journal*, 11(2), 34–35.
- Matielo, R., Oliveira, R. P. de, & Baretta, L. (2018). <b>Intralingual subtitles, interlingual subtitles, and L2 vocabulary: developments from an exploratory study. *Acta Scientiarum. Language and Culture*, 40(1), 36570. <https://doi.org/10.4025/actascilangcult.v40i1.36570>
- Meiningsih, F. A. 2015. *The Effectiveness of Sing Vocabulary Self-Collection Strategy and Interactive Cloze Strategy to Improve Students' Vocabulary Mastery*. Published Thesis. Semarang: Faculty of Languages and Arts Unnes.
- Nengsih, G. 2013. Teaching Vocabulary of Descriptive Text by Combining Vocabulary Self-Collection Strategy (VSS) and Word Walls Strategy in the Sixth Grade of Elementary School Students. *Jurnal Pendidikan Bahasa Inggris*, 2(2). (<http://id.portalgaruda.org/?ref=browse&mod=viewarticle&article=182601> ), retrieved on November 24<sup>th</sup>, 2015.
- Ruddell, M. R., & Shearer, B. A. (2002). “ Extraordinary ,” “ tremendous ,” “ exhilarating ” “ magnificent ”: Middle school at-risk students become avid word learners with the Vocabulary Self-Collection Strategy ( VS ). *Journal of Adolescent and Adult Literacy*, 45(5), 352–363.